

FILED**MAY 09 2006**CATHY A. CATTERSON, CLERK
U.S. COURT OF APPEALS**FOR PUBLICATION**

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in New York, New York,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

ENC CORPORATION; SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Switzerland with an address at rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCOS; IMELDA R. MARCOS; FERDINAND R. MARCOS, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA; FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR

No. 04-16401

D.C. No. CV-00-00595-MLR

**ORDER AMENDING
OPINION**

R E C E I V E D
CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT

APR 11 2006

DISTRICT OF HAWAII

CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W OBS, United Kingdom; THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS; GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Georgia, with a registered office at 710 West First Street, Blue Ridge, Georgia 30513, and a mailing address at 260 Carrollton St., Buchanan, GA 30113,

Defendants,

and,

ARELMA, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Panama with a permanent address at Ave. Justo Arosemena y Calle 41 Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de Panama, and a mailing address at c/o Suntrust Investment Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland;;

Defendant - Appellant,

MARIANO J. PIMENTAL, on behalf of himself and all other persons similarly situated;;

Defendant - Appellee,

PHILIPPINE NATIONAL BANK,

Defendant - Appellant.

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in New York, New York,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

ENC CORPORATION; ARELMA, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Panama with a permanent address at Ave. Justo Arosemena y Calle 41 Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de Panama, and a mailing address at c/o Suntrust Investment Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Switzerland with an address at rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCOS; IMELDA R. MARCOS; FERDINAND R. MARCOS, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA; FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing

No. 04-16503

D.C. No. CV-00-00595-MLR

under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W OBS, United Kingdom; THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS; GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Georgia, with a registered office at 710 West First Street, Blue Ridge, Georgia 30513, and a mailing address at 260 Carrollton St., Buchanan, GA 30113; PHILIPPINE NATIONAL BANK,

Defendants,

and,

MARIANO J. PIMENTAL, on behalf of himself and all other persons similarly situated;;

Defendant - Appellee,

REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES; PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION ON GOOD GOVERNMENT, a government agency of the Republic of the Philippines,

Defendants - Appellants.

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in New York, New York,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

ENC CORPORATION; ARELMA, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Panama with a permanent address at Ave. Justo Arosemena y Calle 41 Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de Panama, and a mailing address at c/o Suntrust Investment Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Switzerland with an address at rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland; JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCOS; IMELDA R. MARCOS; FERDINAND R. MARCOS, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA; FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an

No. 04-16538

D.C. No. CV-00-00595-MLR

address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W OBS, United Kingdom; PHILIPPINE NATIONAL BANK; REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES; PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION ON GOOD GOVERNMENT, a government agency of the Republic of the Philippines,

Defendants,

and,

THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS; GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Georgia, with a registered office at 710 West First Street, Blue Ridge, Georgia 30513, and a mailing address at 260 Carrollton St., Buchanan, GA 30113;;

Defendants - Appellants,

MARIANO J. PIMENTAL, on behalf of himself and all other persons similarly situated,

Defendant - Appellee.

Appeal from the United States District Court
for the District of Hawaii

Manuel L. Real, District Judge, Presiding

Argued and Submitted March 14, 2005
San Francisco, California

Before: NOONAN, THOMAS, Circuit Judges, and ROBART*, District Judge.

The opinion filed on May 4, 2006, is amended as follows: on slip opinion page 5038, lines 29-32, the following sentence is deleted: "The phrase 'equity and good conscience' in our judicial usage is coterminous with the first opinions of the United States Supreme Court. *See Hollingsworth v. Ogle*, 1 U.S. 257 (1788)."

On slip opinion page 5038, line 29, the following sentence is added: "The phrase 'equity and good conscience' in our judicial usage is coterminous with the early opinions of the United States Supreme Court. *See Elmendorf v. Taylor*, 23 U.S. (10 Wheat.) 152, 181 (1825)."

* The Honorable James L. Robart, United States District Judge for the Western District of Washington, sitting by designation.

INTERNAL USE ONLY: Proceedings include all events.
04-16401 Merrill Lynch, v. Arelna, Inc., et al

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER
AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a
corporation organized and
existing under the laws of the
State of Delaware with its
principal place of business in
New York, New York

Plaintiff - Appellee

Jeffrey S. Portnoy, Esq.
FAX 808/540-5040
808/521-9200
Suite 1100
[COR LD NTC ret]
CADES, SCHUTTE, FLEMING &
WRIGHT
1000 Bishop Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

A. Robert Pietrzak, Esq.
212/839-5300
[COR LD NTC ret]
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP
787 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10019

v.

ENC CORPORATION
Defendant

ARELMA, INC., a corporation
organized and existing under
the laws of Panama with a
permanent address at Ave.
Justo Arosemena y Calle 41
Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio
Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de
Panama, and a mailing address
at c/o Suntrust Invenstment
Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2,
P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6,
Switzerland
Defendant - Appellant

Andrew V. Beaman, Esq.
808/528-8200
900 Hawaii Tower
[COR LD NTC ret]
CHUN, KERR, DODD, BEAMAN & WONG
745 Fort Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

Barry A. Smith
Suite 2400
[COR LD ret]
BUCHALTER NEMER FIELDS &
YOUNGER, APC
601 S. Figueroa St.
Los Angeles, CA 90017-5704

Carol A. Eblen, Esq.
808/547-5600
18th Floor
[COR LD NTC ret]
Ali'i Place
1099 Alakea Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

Jay R. Ziegler, Esq.
FAX 213/896-0400
213/891-0700
Suite 1500
[COR LD NTC ret]
BUCHALER NEMER, PC
1000 Wilshire Blvd.
Los Angeles, CA 90017-2457

SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A.,

William C. McCorriston, Esq.

INTERNAL USE ONLY: Proceedings include all events.
04-16401 Merrill Lynch, v. Arelna, Inc., et al

a corporation organized and existing under the laws of Switzerland with an address at rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland Defendant

FAX 808-524-8293
808-529-7300
4th Floor
[COR LD NTC ret]
McCORRISTON MILLER MUKAI
MacKINNON LLP
Attorney at Law
Five Waterfront Plaza
500 Ala Moana Boulevard
Honolulu, HI 96813

JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCO; IMELDA R. MARCO; FERDINAND R. MARCO, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA

Defendant

FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W 0BS, United Kingdom

Defendant

THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS
Defendant

Daniel C. Cathcart, Esq.
FAX 310/785-9143
310/553-6630
Suite 810
[COR LD NTC ret]
MAGANA CATHCART & McCARTHY
1801 Avenue of the Stars
Los Angeles, CA 90067-5899

GOLDEN BUDHA CORPORATION, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Georgia, with a

Daniel C. Cathcart, Esq.
(See above)
[COR LD NTC ret]

INTERNAL USE ONLY: Proceedings include all events.
04-16503 Merrill Lynch, v. Philippines, et al

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER
AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a
corporation organized and
existing under the laws of the
State of Delaware with its
principal place of business in
New York, New York

Plaintiff - Appellee

Jeffrey S. Portnoy, Esq.
FAX 808/540-5040
808/521-9200
Suite 1100
[COR LD NTC ret]
CADES, SCHUTTE, FLEMING &
WRIGHT
1000 Bishop Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

A. Robert Pietrzak, Esq.
212/839-5300
[COR LD NTC ret]
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP
787 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10019

v.

ENC CORPORATION
Defendant

Andrew V. Beaman, Esq.
808/528-8200
900 Hawaii Tower
[COR LD ret]
CHUN, KERR, DODD, BEAMAN & WONG
745 Fort Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

ARELMA, INC., a corporation
organized and existing under
the laws of Panama with a
permanent address at Ave.
Justo Alosemena y Calle 41
Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio
Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de
Panama, and a mailing address
at c/o Suntrust Invenstment
Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2,
P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6,
Switzerland
Defendant

Barry A. Smith
Suite 2400
[COR LD ret]
BUCHALTER NEMER FIELDS &
YOUNGER, APC
601 S. Figueroa St.
Los Angeles, CA 90017-5704

Carol A. Eblen, Esq.
808/547-5600
18th Floor
[COR LD ret]
Ali'i Place
1099 Alakea Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A.,
a corporation organized and
existing under the laws of
Switzerland with an address at
rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box
76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland
Defendant

William C. McCorriston, Esq.
FAX 808-524-8293
808-529-7300
4th Floor
[COR LD ret]
McCORMISTON MILLER MUKAI
MACKINNON LLP
Attorney at Law
Five Waterfront Plaza
500 Ala Moana Boulevard

INTERNAL USE ONLY: Proceedings include all events.
04-16538 Merrill Lynch, v. Estate of Roger, et al

MERRILL LYNCH, PIERCE, FENNER
AND SMITH, INCORPORATED, a
corporation organized and
existing under the laws of the
State of Delaware with its
principal place of business in
New York, New York

Plaintiff - Appellee

Jeffrey S. Portnoy, Esq.
FAX 808/540-5040
808/521-9200
Suite 1100
[COR LD NTC ret]
CADES, SCHUTTE, FLEMING &
WRIGHT
1000 Bishop Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

A. Robert Pietrzak, Esq.
212/839-5300
[COR LD NTC ret]
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP
787 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10019

v.

ENC CORPORATION
Defendant

Andrew V. Beaman, Esq.
808/528-8200
900 Hawaii Tower
[COR LD ret]
CHUN, KERR, DODD, BEAMAN & WONG
745 Fort Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

ARELMA, INC., a corporation
organized and existing under
the laws of Panama with a
permanent address at Ave.
Justo Alosemena y Calle 41
Este, No. 40-59 Pte al Colegio
Immaculada, Panama 1.Rep.de
Panama, and a mailing address
at c/o Suntrust Invenstment
Co.S.A., ru de Jargonnant 2,
P.O. Box 76, 1211 Geneva 6,
Switzerland
Defendant

Barry A. Smith
Suite 2400
[COR LD ret]
BUCHALTER NEMER FIELDS &
YOUNGER, APC
601 S. Figueroa St.
Los Angeles, CA 90017-5704

SUNTRUST INVESTMENT CO., S.A.,
a corporation organized and
existing under the laws of
Switzerland with an address at
rue de Jargonnant 2, P.O. Box
76, 1211 Geneva 6, Switzerland
Defendant

Carol A. Eblen, Esq.
808/547-5600
18th Floor
[COR LD ret]
Ali'i Place
1099 Alakea Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

William C. McCorriston, Esq.
FAX 808-524-8293
808-529-7300
4th Floor
[COR LD ret]
McCORMISTON MILLER MUKAI
MacKINNON LLP
Attorney at Law
Five Waterfront Plaza
500 Ala Moana Boulevard

INTERNAL USE ONLY: Proceedings include all events.
04-16538 Merrill Lynch, v. Estate of Roger, et al

Honolulu, HI 96813

JOHN K. BURNS, a citizen of the United States, with an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite, 900, Chicago, Illinois, 60606; THE ESTATE OF FERDINAND E. MARCO; IMELDA R. MARCO; FERDINAND R. MARCO, JR.; MARIA IMELDA MARCOS; IRENE MARCOS ARANETA

Defendant

FRONTIER RISK CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, L.C.C., a limited liability company organized and existing under the laws of the States of Nevada, with a registered office at 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500, Reno, NV. 89511 and an address at 300 Wacker Drive, Suite 900, Chicago, IL 60606; GROSVENOR CAPITAL LTD., a company organized and existing under the law of the United Kingdom, with an address at Grosvenor Gardens House, Suite 117, 35-37 Grosvenor Gardens, London SW1 W 0BS, United Kingdom

Defendant

THE ESTATE OF ROGER ROXAS
Defendant - Appellant

Terry R. Grimm
[COR LD ret]
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
35 W. Wacker Dr.
Chicago, IL 60601-9703

Terry R. Grimm
(See above)
[COR LD ret]

Alexander T. McLaren, Esq.
Suite 2450
[COR LD NTC ret]
1001 Bishop Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

Daniel C. Cathcart, Esq.
FAX 310/785-9143
310/553-6630
Suite 810
[COR LD NTC ret]
MAGANA CATHCART & McCARTHY
1801 Avenue of the Stars
Los Angeles, CA 90067-5899

Ward D. Jones, Esq.
FAX 808/550-4991
808/550-4990
Suite 1400
[COR LD ret]
BERVAR & JONES
1001 Bishop Street